

- 9 Ishikawa, E.A. *et al.* (2002) Genetic variation in populations of *Leishmania* species in Brazil. *Trans. R. Soc. Trop. Med. Hyg.* 96(Suppl. 1), S111–S121
- 10 Schwenkenbecher, J.M. *et al.* (2004) Evolution and conservation of microsatellite markers for *Leishmania tropica*. *Infect. Genet. Evol.* 4, 99–105
- 11 Corbett, C.E. (1999) *Leishmania (Viannia) panamensis/Leishmania (Leishmania) amazonensis* – a warning. *Parasitol. Today* 15, 81

1471-4922/\$ - see front matter © 2005 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.
doi:10.1016/j.pt.2005.12.007

Letters Response

Response to Li *et al.* and Shaw: Return of the ring – opportunities to challenge a hypothesis

Filip Claes^{1,2}, Jean-Claude Dujardin², Louis Touratier³, Philippe Büscher² and Bruno Maria Goddeeris¹

¹Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Faculty of Bioscience Engineering, Department of Biosystems, Kasteelpark Arenberg 30, 3001 Leuven, Belgium

²Institute of Tropical Medicine, Department of Parasitology, Nationalestraat 155, 2000 Antwerpen, Belgium

³World Organization for Animal Health, 12 Rue de Prony, 75017 Paris, France

We appreciate the comments of Li *et al.* in this issue about our article in *Trends in Parasitology*. However, there are two reasons why we do not share their opinion that *Trypanosoma equiperdum* strains should not be considered to be *Trypanosoma evansi* without examining kinetoplast maxicircles.

First, the value of kinetoplast maxicircles for distinguishing both species is questionable because of the existence of dyskinetoplastic strains in the *Trypanozoon* subgenus, which was even stated in one of the previous articles by the same research group [1]. The use by Li *et al.* of PCR on NADH dehydrogenase to distinguish *T. evansi* from *T. equiperdum* might be invalid because, using this approach, Swiss Tropical Institute Basel (STIB) 818 is classified as a *T. equiperdum* strain, whereas our results and those of others cluster this strain into the *T. evansi* group [2–4].

Second, Li *et al.* support their approach with unpublished results, including reference to two strains (STIB 841 and STIB 842) for which no data are publicly available. These stabilates from the cryobank of the Swiss Tropical Institute Basel (<http://www.sti.ch/>) originate from the University of Bordeaux (<http://www.u-bordeaux2.fr/>), which had only Bordeaux *Trypanosoma* antigen type (BoTat) and Onderstepoort Veterinary Institute (OVI) in its collection by the 1980s. Thus, STIB 841 and STIB 842 are probably BoTat and OVI, or two variants of BoTat. Hence, the data from Li *et al.* confirm our classification, except (again) for STIB 818.

Furthermore, we do not fully agree with the statement by Li *et al.* about the *Trypanozoon* subgenus that ‘several biochemical and molecular methods fail to distinguish among them’. This does not hold for *Trypanosoma brucei gambiense* type I, at least, which – as determined by all techniques used so far – is separate from the other *Trypanozoon* members [5,6].

The same could be true for *T. evansi* type B, which differs from classical *T. evansi* with regard to its minicircles only, and is not a *T. brucei* because it does not differentiate into procyclic forms [7,8]. Could *T. evansi* type B belong to a new *T. brucei* subgroup, as we suspect is the case for the *T. equiperdum* OVI and BoTat strains? Unfortunately, our repeated requests to obtain the four unique strains of *T. evansi* type B [held at the Kenya Agriculture Research Institute (<http://www.kari.org>), which was formerly known as the Kenya Trypanosomiasis Research Institute] for use in our investigations have been unsuccessful.

Jeffrey Shaw’s comments in this issue about mislabeled strains are relevant to the preceding discussion. Similar problems and confusion have also arisen in leishmaniasis typing. In 1990, a World Health Organization [WHO (<http://www.who.int/en/>)] expert panel published a list of *Leishmania* reference strains, later called the WHO references [9]. These strains are available from reference cryobanks in which regular typing ensures their identity. However, the same strains are also being circulated worldwide, with the same label but without quality control. In the context of possible mistaken identities, it might be worthwhile implementing some controls: (i) for evaluating biological parameters, one should work only with strains that are provided directly by a reference bank and that have a sufficiently documented history and DNA print; and (ii) these ‘reference’ strains should be included in molecular characterization assays.

In conclusion, the introduction of molecular techniques has made the biological species concept problematic in some cases, especially in kinetoplastid parasites that undergo predominantly asexual reproduction. There is an urgent need for a consensus about how to merge the ‘ancient’ biological species parameters such as host range, vector and induced pathology (disease) with the ‘new’ molecular parameters. Therefore, we invite all

Corresponding author: Claes, F. (fclaes@itg.be).

researchers to join efforts by sharing all available *T. equiperdum*, *T. evansi* and *T. evansi* type B strains and by analyzing them using as many techniques as possible, including the detection of maxicircle DNA, to determine the taxonomic position of the strains.

References

- 1 Lun, Z.R. *et al.* (2004) Molecular profiles of *T. brucei*, *T. evansi* and *T. equiperdum* stocks revealed by the random amplified polymorphic DNA method. *Parasitol. Res.* 92, 335–340
- 2 Claes, F. *et al.* (2003) How does *Trypanosoma equiperdum* fit into the *Trypanozoon* group? A cluster analysis by random amplified polymorphic DNA (RAPD) and multiple endonuclease genotyping approach (MEGA). *Parasitology* 126, 425–431
- 3 Zhang, Z.Q. and Baltz, T. (1994) Identification of *Trypanosoma evansi*, *Trypanosoma equiperdum* and *Trypanosoma brucei brucei* using repetitive DNA probes. *Vet. Parasitol.* 53, 197–208
- 4 Biteau, N. *et al.* (2000) Characterization of *Trypanozoon* isolates using a repeated coding sequence and microsatellite markers. *Mol. Biochem. Parasitol.* 105, 185–201
- 5 Gibson, W. (2003) Species concepts for trypanosomes: from morphological to molecular definitions? *Kinetoplastid Biol. Dis.* 2, 10
- 6 Simo, G. *et al.* (2005) *Trypanosoma brucei* s.l.: characterisation of stocks from Central Africa by PCR analysis of mobile genetic elements. *Exp. Parasitol.* 110, 353–362
- 7 Gibson, W.C. *et al.* (1983) Characterisation of *Trypanosoma (Trypanozoon) evansi* from camels in Kenya using isoenzyme electrophoresis. *Res. Vet. Sci.* 34, 114–118
- 8 Ngaira, J.M. *et al.* (2003) Evaluation of antigen and antibody rapid detection tests for *Trypanosoma evansi* infection in camels in Kenya. *Vet. Parasitol.* 114, 131–141
- 9 World Health Organization (1990) Control of the leishmaniases. Report of a WHO Expert Committee. *World Health Organ. Tech. Rep. Ser.* 793, 1–158

1471-4922/\$ - see front matter © 2005 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.
doi:10.1016/j.pt.2005.12.002

Endeavour

the quarterly magazine for the history
and philosophy of science

You can access *Endeavour* online via
ScienceDirect, where you'll find a
collection of beautifully illustrated
articles on the history of science, book
reviews and editorial comment.

featuring

Selling the silver: country house libraries and the history of science by Roger Gaskell and Patricia Fara
Carl Schmidt – a chemical tourist in Victorian Britain by R. Stefan Ross
The rise, fall and resurrection of group selection by M.E. Borello
Mary Anning: the fossilist as exegete by T.W. Goodhue
Caroline Herschel: 'the unquiet heart' by M. Hoskin
Science in the 19th-century zoo by Oliver Hochadel
The melancholy of anatomy by P. Fara

and coming soon

Etienne Geoffroy St-Hillaire, Napoleon's Egyptian campaign and a theory of everything by P. Humphries
Losing it in New Guinea: The voyage of HMS *Rattlesnake* by J. Goodman
The accidental conservationist by M.A. Andrei
Powering the porter brewery by J. Sumner
Female scientists in films by B.A. Jones

and much, much more . . .

Locate *Endeavour* on *ScienceDirect* (<http://www.sciencedirect.com>)